

A History of Psycholinguistics The Pre-Chomskyan Era

Willem J.M. Levelt

Director Emeritus,

Max Planck Institute for Psycholinguistics,

Nijmegen, the Netherlands

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

OXFORD
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Great Clarendon Street, Oxford, OX2 6DP,
United Kingdom

Oxford University Press is a department of the University of Oxford.
It furthers the University's objective of excellence in research, scholarship,
and education by publishing worldwide. Oxford is a registered trade mark of
Oxford University Press in the UK and in certain other countries

© Oxford University Press, 2013

The moral rights of the author have been asserted

First Edition published in 2013

Impression: 1

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in
a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the
prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press, or as expressly permitted
by law, by licence or under terms agreed with the appropriate reprographics
rights organization. Enquiries concerning reproduction outside the scope of the
above should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the
address above

You must not circulate this work in any other form
and you must impose this same condition on any acquirer

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data
Data available

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data
Library of Congress Control Number: 2012937862

ISBN 978-0-19-965366-9

Printed and bound in Great Britain by
CPI Group (UK) Ltd, Croydon, CR0 4YY

Whilst every effort has been made to ensure that the contents of this work are as complete, accurate
and up-to-date as possible at the date of writing, Oxford University Press is not able to give any
guarantee or assurance that such is the case. Readers are urged to take appropriately qualified medical
advice in all cases. The information in this work is intended to be useful to the general reader, but
should not be used as a means of self-diagnosis or for the prescription of medication.

Links to third party websites are provided by Oxford in good faith and
for information only. Oxford disclaims any responsibility for the materials
contained in any third party website referenced in this work.

Contents

Part 1 **Orientation**

1 1951 3

The Interdisciplinary Summer Seminar in Psychology and Linguistics
and its follow-up 3

Cornell 1951 3

Indiana 1953 7

George Miller's *Language and communication* 11

Karl Lashley's *The problem of serial order in behavior* 15

Other 1951 milestones 18

Part 2 **Establishing the discipline: 1770–1900**

2 Inventing a psychology of language 21

The origins of language 21

From the Enlightenment to Romanticism 21

Historical and comparative philology 25

The root barrier and beyond 28

Darwinian evolution and language origins 35

Heymann Steinthal 40

Psychology 42

Language genesis 45

Disorders of language and speech 48

Steinthal's invention 50

Retrospect 50

3 From bumps to diagrams: Tracing language in the brain 52

The physiognomic beginnings 52

Against localization 58

Phrenology without bumps 59

The left hemisphere and Broca's area 60

Trousseau seeds confusion 67

Carl Wernicke and the diagram makers 68

Baginsky 68

Wernicke 1874 69

The Wernicke–Lichtheim model 74

Diagram makers and making diagrams 79

- Adolf Kussmaul's textbook 82
- One more diagram maker: Jean-Martin Charcot 87
- Some non-localizationist sounds 88
- Retrospect 92
- 4 Language acquisition and the diary explosion 93**
 - Perspectives on language acquisition 93
 - Early scholars of language acquisition 94
 - Jean Héroard* 94
 - Dietrich Tiedemann and Moritz von Winterfeld* 95
 - Berthold Sigismund* 96
 - Hippolyte Taine and Charles Darwin* 97
 - Jan Baudouin de Courtenay* 99
 - Bernard Perez* 100
 - Fritz Schultze* 100
 - Ludwig Strümpell* 100
 - William Preyer* 101
 - George Romanes* 104
 - Gabriel Compayré and Gabriel Deville* 104
 - Frederick Tracy* 105
 - James Sully* 106
 - Kathleen Carter Moore* 106
 - Wilhelm Ament* 107
 - The community of child language researchers* 108
 - Issues and controversies in child language 108
 - Origins of child language* 108
 - Sound development* 110
 - Inner speech development* 112
 - Ontogenesis recapitulating phylogenesis* 115
 - Gestures and gesture languages* 116
 - Charles-Michel de l'Épée and Joseph-Marie Degérando* 117
 - The demise of Deaf sign language* 121
 - Retrospect 123
- 5 Language in the laboratory and modeling microgenesis 125**
 - Mental chronometry: Franciscus Donders 125
 - Phonetics and Wolfgang von Kempelen's speaking machine 129
 - Reading and naming 131
 - Hubert von Grashey* 131
 - James McKeen Cattell* 132
 - Benno Erdmann and Raymond Dodge* 135
 - Walter Pillsbury and Oscar Quanz* 139
 - Edmund Huey* 140

Speech perception and William Bagley	141
Verbal learning, memory, and habits	144
<i>Hermann Ebbinghaus</i>	144
<i>Benjamin Bourdon</i>	146
Association and analogy	148
<i>Francis Galton</i>	148
<i>Martin Trautscholdt</i>	148
<i>James McKeen Cattell</i>	149
<i>Joseph Jastrow and Gustav Aschaffenburg</i>	151
<i>Albert Thumb and Karl Marbe</i>	151
Speech errors	155
<i>Rudolf Meringer and Carl Mayer</i>	155
<i>Heath Bawden</i>	163
Retrospect	164
6 Wilhelm Wundt's grand synthesis	165
A productive life	165
Wundt's psychology	169
<i>Experimental and ethnic psychology</i>	169
<i>Association and apperception</i>	170
<i>Voluntarism</i>	171
Expressive movements	172
Sign language	174
<i>Types of sign language</i>	174
<i>Pointing, imitating, and abstract signs</i>	175
<i>Grammatical categories and sign syntax</i>	175
<i>No match to spoken languages, but a window on the origins of language</i>	177
Speech sounds	178
<i>Evolution of vocal expression</i>	178
<i>Children's acquisition of sound patterns</i>	179
<i>Natural sounds</i>	180
<i>Folk psychology of sound change</i>	181
<i>Three types of sound change in the individual and in the language community</i>	181
<i>Contact effects: assimilation and dissimilation</i>	182
<i>Distance effects: analogy</i>	183
<i>Regular sound change: Grimm's laws</i>	184
Words	186
<i>Word formation in brain and mind</i>	186
<i>Parts of speech</i>	190
<i>Meaning change</i>	191
Formulating sentences	193
<i>Where do sentences come from?</i>	193

<i>Varieties of syntax and phrase structure</i>	195
<i>Sentence prosody</i>	199
<i>Outer and internal speech form</i>	201
The origins of language	202
Wundt's psycholinguistic legacy	204
Epilogue: turning the century	208

Part 3 Twentieth-century psycholinguistics before the "cognitive revolution"

7 New perspectives: Structuralism and the psychology of imageless thought	213
Emerging structuralism: Taine, Baudouin de Courtenay, and Saussure	213
Structuralism and the psychology of language: Sechehaye	218
Parisian structuralism and Henri Delacroix	222
The psychology of imageless thought: the Würzburg school	225
The Bühler–Wundt clash	228
Otto Selz and Charlotte Bühler on sentence formulation	233
Otto Selz	233
Charlotte Bühler	237
Retrospect	238
8 Verbal behavior	239
Heterogeneous behaviorism	240
Watson and vocalic thought	242
Speech for social control: Grace de Laguna and John Markey	245
From Stumpf to Bloomfield	249
Max Meyer	249
Albert Paul Weiss	251
Leonard Bloomfield	254
Bloomfield's behaviorist heritage: Zellig Harris and Noam Chomsky	258
Kantor's psycholinguistics	260
Burrhus Frederic Skinner	264
Mediation theory	271
Semantic conditioning	271
Cofer and Foley's analysis	272
Charles Osgood's theory and measurement of meaning	274
Hobart Mowrer: the sentence as conditioning device	278
Retrospect	279
9 Speech acts and functions	281
Philip Wegener and Adolf Reinach, the pioneers	282
Alan Gardiner: the functions of word and sentence	285
Karl Bühler	287

<i>From Würzburg to Vienna</i>	287
<i>The functions of language</i>	290
<i>The Organon Model</i>	292
<i>The two-field theory of reference</i>	295
<i>The deictic field</i>	295
<i>The symbol field: a two-class system</i>	298
<i>The principle of abstractive reference</i>	298
<i>Lexicon</i>	299
<i>Syntax</i>	300
<i>Composition</i>	301
<i>Case structure</i>	302
<i>The sound stream</i>	304
<i>Bühler's axioms</i>	305
<i>Bühler and the Prague school</i>	305
Functions and speech acts in retrospect	307
10 Language acquisition: Wealth of data, dearth of theory	309
Clara and William Stern	309
Leading twentieth-century scholars and research teams before the " cognitive revolution "	316
Michael Vincent O'Shea	316
Ivan Gheorgov and studies of self-reference	317
Jules Ronjat and Milivoje Pavlovitch	318
Scandinavian diary studies: Otto Jespersen	319
Jacques van Ginneken	321
Emil Fröschels	323
Jean Piaget	324
Lev Semenovich Vygotsky	327
Elemér Kenyeres	329
David and Rosa Katz	330
Yosikazu Ohwaki	331
Ovide Decroly	332
The Institutes of Child Welfare	332
Michael Morris Lewis and his sources	334
Antoine Grégoire	335
Roman Jakobson	335
Aleksandr Gvozdev and Werner Leopold	337
The growth of vocabulary and utterance complexity	338
Studies in speech sound development	343
From first cries to words: Lewis, Bühler, and Hetzer	344
Physiology, environment, and heredity in early sound formation: Grégoire and van Ginneken	347
Sound assimilation and children's early words: Röttger's dissertation	349

- Jakobson on universals of phonological development* 352
- The Child Welfare Institutes on early sound development* 354
- Sound development in Gvozdev's and Leopold's diaries* 356
- Language acquisition in bilingual environments 357
- Retrospect: data, theory, and method 360
- 11 Language in the brain: The lures of holism** 364
 - Joseph Jules Dejerine 364
 - Pierre Marie 365
 - Pierre Marie's "deconstruction" 366
 - The aphasia debate 371
 - The aftermath 373
 - A German response: Hugo Liepmann 376
 - The continuing German tradition 378
 - Carl Wernicke* 378
 - Wernicke's assistants* 380
 - Constantin von Monakow* 382
 - A psychological approach to agrammatism: Arnold Pick 383
 - Responses to Pick 387
 - Karl Kleist 387
 - Max Isserlin's adaptation theory 389
 - Henry Head: a holist's view on theory in aphasiology 392
 - Words as units of speech* 394
 - Centers and their lesions* 394
 - Adaptation* 395
 - Aphasic syndromes* 396
 - Localization* 396
 - Methodology* 396
 - Kurt Goldstein and the single case study 397
 - Holism and the organismic approach* 398
 - General effects of brain damage* 400
 - Instrumentalities and abstract language* 400
 - Inner speech* 401
 - Language functions* 401
 - Forms of language disturbance* 401
 - Localization* 402
 - Epilogue* 402
 - Roman Jakobson 403
 - Theodore Weisenburg and Katherine McBride: aphasia is diverse 405
 - Other American contributions 406
 - Alexander Romanovich Luria 408
 - The systems approach* 410

	<i>Data base</i>	410
	<i>The structure of speech activity</i>	410
	<i>Phonemic analysis</i>	411
	<i>Temporal lobe systems</i>	412
	<i>Frontal systems</i>	413
	<i>Parieto-occipital systems</i>	413
	Retrospect	414
12	Empirical studies of speech and language usage	416
	Perception and production of speech and language	417
	<i>Perceiving consonants and vowels</i>	417
	<i>Harvey Fletcher's approach to intelligibility</i>	422
	<i>Perceiving words: noise and number of alternatives</i>	423
	<i>Skinner's "verbal summator" and response bias</i>	426
	<i>Speech errors</i>	427
	<i>Articulation</i>	428
	<i>Delayed speech</i>	429
	Meaning	430
	<i>Associations</i>	430
	<i>Scaling</i>	436
	<i>Meaningfulness</i>	437
	<i>Content analysis</i>	437
	<i>Phonetic symbolism</i>	438
	<i>Metaphor and physiognomy</i>	444
	Verbal learning and memory: orders of approximation	445
	The statistical approach	449
	<i>The rank-frequency distribution</i>	450
	<i>The number-of-words-frequency distribution: Zipf's law</i>	451
	<i>Zipf's law in associations</i>	455
	<i>Diversity of words in language usage</i>	455
	<i>Yule on the statistics of style</i>	456
	<i>Word frequency and recognition threshold</i>	457
	<i>Word frequency and word association</i>	459
	<i>Transitional probabilities</i>	459
	Individual differences	460
	<i>Linguistic abilities</i>	460
	<i>Projective-clinical</i>	461
	<i>Personality</i>	461
	Reading	464
	<i>Edmund Huey's text</i>	464
	<i>Tachistoscopic studies</i>	466
	<i>Eye-tracking studies</i>	469

	<i>The Stroop paradigm</i>	471
	Retrospect	473
13	A new cross-linguistic perspective and linguistic relativity	474
	Verticalism	475
	Horizontalism	478
	<i>Arthur Hocart</i>	478
	<i>Franz Boas</i>	479
	<i>Edward Sapir and linguistic relativism</i>	482
	The world view approach and linguistic relativism	486
	<i>Johann Leo Weisgerber</i>	486
	<i>Benjamin Whorf, self-taught linguist</i>	488
	<i>Whorf's "horizontalism"</i>	489
	<i>Whorf on linguistic relativism</i>	490
	<i>Whorf's universalism</i>	492
	<i>Whorf and the public interest</i>	493
	Clear language	494
	<i>Lady Welby-Gregory</i>	494
	<i>Dutch Significa</i>	494
	<i>General Semantics</i>	495
	<i>George Orwell</i>	497
	<i>Some Soviet thoughts</i>	498
	Studies of relativity after Sapir-Whorf	499
	<i>The 1953 Conference on Language in Culture</i>	499
	<i>The codability experiments: Eric Lenneberg and Roger Brown</i>	500
	<i>The coding of facial expressions</i>	503
	<i>Grammatical categories and cognition</i>	504
	Retrospect: John Carroll's verdict	506
14	Psychology of language during the Third Reich	508
	Language, race, and world view	508
	The 1931 Hamburg Congress of the German Psychological Society	512
	The 1933 Leipzig Congress of the German Psychological Society	513
	The 1933 "restoration" of the universities	516
	<i>William and Clara Stern</i>	516
	<i>Ernst Cassirer</i>	517
	<i>Heinz Werner</i>	518
	<i>Kurt Goldstein and Adhémar Gelb</i>	518
	<i>Wolfgang Köhler</i>	519
	<i>David and Rosa Katz</i>	520

Max Isserlin 521

Otto Selz 521

1933–1938: some further developments 522

The Austrian *Anschluß* 524

*The fate of the Bùhl*ers 524

Frieda Eisler 530

Emil Fröschels 530

Roman Jakobson 530

Nikolaj Trubetskoy 531

German neurologists in war time 531

Friedrich Kainz 533

Retrospect 545

Part 4 **Psycholinguistics re-established**

15 Psycholinguistics post-war, pre-Chomsky 549

The 1950 Conference on Speech Communication 550

The British scene 553

Some further developments in the study of the brain and language 557

Soviet Union 557

Germany 557

United Kingdom 558

United States 559

France and Belgium 560

Italy 561

Canada: Wilder Penfield and electrical brain stimulation 561

Géza Révész and the Amsterdam symposium on thinking and speaking 564

Old and new in developmental psycholinguistics 565

Second-language learning and bilingualism 566

Experimental studies of language acquisition 568

The state of general psycholinguistics since 1951 571

Epilogue 577

Bibliography 579

Author Index 623

Subject Index 635